

Court of Appeals, Division One

Civil Appeal

1 CA-CV 24-0750

GIPSON v. SHINNICK, et al.

Appellate Case Information

Case Filed: 11-Oct-2024

Case Closed:

Dept/Composition

Department A

Hon. Paul J McMurdie
Hon. Samuel A Thumma
Hon. Kent E Cattani

Side 1. NARVETTA GIPSON, Plaintiff/Appellant

(Litigant Group) NARVETTA GIPSON

- Narvetta Gipson PRO SE

Side 2. KEVIN SHINNICK, et al., Defendant/Appellee

(Litigant Group) KEVIN SHINNICK, et al.

- Kevin Shinnick PRO SE
Laura Shinnick PRO SE

(Litigant Group) RENTAL RENOVATORS, INC.

- Rental Renovators Inc Attorneys for: Defendants/Appellees Rental
Neal H Bookspan, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 14343)
Ian Matthew Fischer, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 26239)

CASE STATUS

Jan 14, 2026....Pending in ASC

Table with 6 columns: PREDECESSOR CASE(S), Cause/Charge/Class, Judgment/Sentence, Judge, Role <Comments>, Trial, Dispo. Row 1: MAR, CV2021-004651, Breach of Contract, Timothy J Ryan, Authoring Judge of Order.

Table with 2 columns: DESCENDENT CASE(S), Cause/Charge/Class. Row 1: ASC, CV-26-0011-PR.

2 CASE DECISIONS

03-Oct-2025 OPINION

Vacated
[Vacated per order filed 12/8/2025]

Filed: 03-Oct-2025 Mandate:



Samuel Thumma.....Author
Paul McMurdie.....Concur
Kent Cattani.....Concur

Table with 1 column: Decision Disposition. Content: Affirmed in Part, Vacated in Part, Remanded.

08-Dec-2025 OPINION

Samuel Thumma.....Author
Paul McMurdie.....Concur
Kent Cattani.....Concur

Filed: 08-Dec-2025 Mandate:

Table with 1 column: Decision Disposition. Content: Affirmed in Part, Vacated in Part, Remanded.

77 PROCEEDING ENTRIES

- 1. 11-Oct-2024 FILED: Index of Record, Notice of Appeal from Maricopa County Superior Court filed 09/13/24
2. 11-Oct-2024 FILED: e-Record on Appeal: Instruments/Minute Entries Exhibits: None
3. 11-Oct-2024 FILED: Appellate Clerk Notice re: Appellant's Fee/Case Management Statement/Brief Due
4. 28-Oct-2024 FILED: Case Management Statement (Appellant Pro Per)

Court of Appeals, Division One**Civil Appeal****1 CA-CV 24-0750****GIPSON v. SHINNICK, et al.****77 PROCEEDING ENTRIES**

5.	1-Nov-2024	RECEIPT No.: 2024-01088 ; \$280.00, Authorization: #06012194351, Applied to: NARVETTA GIPSON - Class A Filing Fee (\$280.00) Paid for: NARVETTA GIPSON - By nCourt LLC
6.	20-Nov-2024	FILED: Appellant's First Motion to Extend Time for Opening Brief; Certificate of Service (Appellant Pro Per)
7.	21-Nov-2024	ORDERED: Appellant's First Motion to Extend Time for Opening Brief (Appellant) = GRANTED and extending the time to file the opening brief from 12/10/2024 to 01/09/2025. If the brief is not timely filed, the court will dismiss this appeal. Melina Brill ProTem Judge - Author
8.	22-Nov-2024	FILED: Appellate Clerk Notice re: Appellee's Fee; Appellant's Brief Due
9.	22-Nov-2024	FILED: Settlement Conference Program Notice
10.	2-Dec-2024	FILED: Notice of Payment; Certificate of Service (Appellee Rental)
11.	4-Dec-2024	FILED: Notice of Filing Appellee's Filing Fee; Certificate of Service (Appellee Shinnick)
12.	6-Dec-2024	RECEIPT No.: 2024-01212 ; \$140.00, Authorization: #41010820798, Applied to: RENTAL RENOVATORS, INC. - Class B Filing Fee (\$140.00) Paid for: Jaburg & Wilk PC - By nCourt LLC
13.	10-Dec-2024	RECEIPT No.: 2024-01224 ; \$140.00, Authorization: # 45005098654, Applied to: KEVIN SHINNICK, et al. - Class B Filing Fee (\$140.00) Paid for: Platt and Westby PC - By nCourt, LLC
14.	7-Jan-2025	FILED: Appellant's Second Motion to Extend Time for Opening Brief; Certificate of Service (Appellant Pro Per)
15.	7-Jan-2025	ORDERED: Appellant's Second Motion to Extend Time for Opening Brief (Appellant Pro Per) = GRANTED. Due date EXTENDED from Thursday, 01-09-2025 to Friday, 01-24-2025. If the brief is not timely filed, the court will dismiss this appeal. Melina Brill ProTem Judge - Author
16.	23-Jan-2025	FILED: Appellant's Third Motion to Extend Time for Opening Brief; Appellant's Third Motion to Extend Time for Opening Brief (Certificate of Service) (Duplicate) (Appellant Pro Per)
17.	24-Jan-2025	FILED: Appellee's Objection to Appellants Third Motion for Extension; Certificate of Service (Appellees Shinnick)
18.	24-Jan-2025	ORDERED: Appellant's Third Motion to Extend Time for Opening Brief (Appellant Pro Per) = GRANTED. Due date EXTENDED from Friday, 01-24-2025 to Friday, 01-31-2025. If the brief is not timely filed, the court will dismiss this appeal. Melina Brill ProTem Judge - Author
19.	30-Jan-2025	FILED: Appellant's Motion to Exceed Page Limits for Opening Brief; Certificate of Service (Appellant Pro Per)
20.	31-Jan-2025	FILED: Appellant's Opening Brief; Certificate of Compliance; Certificate of Service (Appellant Pro Per)
21.	1-Feb-2025	FILED: Untitled (Appendix Part 1) (Appellant Pro Per)
22.	1-Feb-2025	FILED: Untitled (Appendix Part 2) (Appellant Pro Per)
23.	1-Feb-2025	FILED: Untitled (Appendix Part 3) (Appellant Pro Per)
24.	1-Feb-2025	FILED: Untitled (Appendix Part 4) (Appellant Pro Per)
25.	14-Feb-2025	ORDERED: Appellant's Motion to Exceed Page Limits for Opening Brief (Appellant Pro Per) = GRANTED and accepting the opening brief filed on 01/31/2025. Melina Brill ProTem Judge - Author
26.	17-Mar-2025	FILED: Appellee Rental Renovator Inc.'s Answering Brief and Notice of Claim for Attorneys' Fees; Appellee Rental Renovator Inc.'s Certificate of Compliance Re: Answering Brief and Notice of Claim for Attorneys' Fees; Appellee Rental Renovator Inc.'s Certificate of Service Re: Answering Brief and Notice of Claim for Attorneys' Fees (Appellees Rental)
27.	17-Mar-2025	FILED: Appellee's [sic] Answer to Appellant's Opening Brief; Certificate of Compliance; Certificate of Service (Appellees Shinnick)
28.	17-Mar-2025	FILED: Appendix (Appellees Shinnick)
29.	2-Apr-2025	FILED: Appellant's First Motion to Extend Time to File Reply Brief (Motion for Procedural Order); Certificate of Service (Appellant Pro Per)
30.	3-Apr-2025	ORDERED: Appellant's First Motion to Extend Time to File Reply Brief (Motion for Procedural Order) (Appellant Pro Per) = GRANTED. Due date EXTENDED from Monday, 04-07-2025 to Monday, 04-28-2025. If the briefs are not timely filed, the court will submit this appeal for decision on the record and the filed briefs. Melina Brill ProTem Judge - Author
31.	25-Apr-2025	FILED: Appellant's Motion to Enlarge Length of Reply Brief; Certificate of Service (Appellant Pro Per)
32.	25-Apr-2025	ORDERED: Appellant's Motion to Enlarge Length of Reply Brief(Appellant Pro Per) = GRANTED. Melina Brill ProTem Judge - Author
33.	28-Apr-2025	FILED: Appellant's Reply Brief; Certificate of Compliance; Certificate of Service (Appellant Pro Per) [Stricken per order filed 5/22/25]

Court of Appeals, Division One**Civil Appeal****1 CA-CV 24-0750****GIPSON v. SHINNICK, et al.****77 PROCEEDING ENTRIES**

34.	28-Apr-2025	FILED: Appellant's Supplemental Appendix (Appellant) [stricken per order filed 5/22/25]
35.	29-Apr-2025	FILED: Appellant's Motion for Additional Transcript (Motion for Procedural Order); Certificate of Service (Appellant Pro Per)
36.	29-Apr-2025	FILED: Appellant's Motion to Set Oral Argument; Certificate of Service (Appellant Pro Per)
37.	6-May-2025	FILED: Appellees' Motion to Strike (Exhibit 34); Certificate of Service (Appellees Rental)
38.	8-May-2025	FILED: Appellees' Response in Opposition to Appellant's Motion to Set Oral Argument; Certificate of Service (Appellees Shinnick and Rental)
39.	13-May-2025	FILED: Appellant's Response To Motion To Strike; Certificate of Service (Appellant Pro Per)
40.	13-May-2025	FILED: Appellant's Reply In Support Of Motion To Set Oral Argument; Certificate of Service (Appellant Pro Per)
41.	14-May-2025	ORDERED: Appellant's Motion for Additional Transcript (Motion for Procedural Order) (Appellant Pro Per) = GRANTED and supplementing the record on appeal with the certified transcript of the 02/05/2024 proceedings. Melina Brill ProTem Judge - Author
42.	15-May-2025	FILED: Appellant's Notice of Filing Transcripts (Attachment A-D); Certificate of Service (Appellant Pro Per)
43.	15-May-2025	FILED: Appellant's Notice of Errata Re Corrected Appellant's Appendix (Appellant's Corrected Appendix); Certificate of Service (Appellant Pro Per)
44.	15-May-2025	FILED: Appellant's Corrected Appendix (Errata Corrected); Certificate of Service (Appellant Pro Per)
45.	15-May-2025	FILED: Appendix No 12 (Appellant Pro Per)
46.	15-May-2025	FILED: Appendix No 19 (Appellant Pro Per)
47.	15-May-2025	FILED: Appendix No 27 (Appellant Pro Per)
48.	20-May-2025	ORDERED: Appellant's Motion to Set Oral Argument (Appellant Pro Per) = DENIED. Hon David B Gass - Author
49.	21-May-2025	FILED: Memorandum – to Clerk of Superior Court Re: any additional record not already transmitted due within 10 days
50.	22-May-2025	ORDERED: Appellees' Motion to Strike (Exhibit 34) (Appellees Rental) = GRANTED in part and striking the supplemental appendix and reply brief. FURTHER ORDERED: directing appellant to re-file the supplemental appendix without Exhibit 34 and the reply brief without the reference to Exhibit 34 by 6/2/25. No other changes are permitted. Melina Brill ProTem Judge - Author
51.	30-May-2025	FILED: Supplemented Superior Court e-Record with Revised Index of Record
52.	2-Jun-2025	FILED: Appellant's Revised Reply Brief; Certificate of Compliance; Certificate of Service (Appellant Pro Per)
53.	2-Jun-2025	FILED: Appellant's Revised Supplemental Appendix (Appellant Pro Per)
54.	25-Jun-2025	FILED: Memorandum – to Clerk of Superior Court Re: any additional record not already transmitted due within 10 days
55.	26-Jun-2025	CLNDR: CONFERENCE, Department A, 8-6-25, COURTROOM 1.
56.	3-Jul-2025	FILED: Supplemented Superior Court e-Record with Revised Index of Record
57.	3-Oct-2025	OPINION (Affirmed in Part, Vacated in Part, Remanded) Hon Samuel A Thumma - Author; Hon Paul J McMurdie - Concur; Hon Kent E Cattani - Concur
58.	3-Oct-2025	FILED: Decision Distribution Notification
59.	14-Oct-2025	FILED: Appellee's [sic] Application for Attorney's Fees and Costs; Certificate of Service (Appellees Shinnick)
60.	14-Oct-2025	FILED: Appellees' Statement of Costs; Certificate of Service (Appellees Shinnick)
61.	20-Oct-2025	FILED: Appellant's Motion for Reconsideration; Appellant's Certificate of Compliance; Certificate of Service (Appellant Pro Per)
62.	20-Oct-2025	FILED: Appellant's Verified Statement of Costs on Appeal; Certificate of Service (Appellant Pro Per)
63.	22-Oct-2025	ORDERED: Directing Appellees Rental Renovators may file a response to the Motion for Reconsideration, addressing the issue of whether Appellant was entitled to prejudgment interest at any time, on or before 11/06/2025. Such response shall not exceed 12 pages in length. Melina Brill ProTem Judge - Author
64.	29-Oct-2025	FILED: Appellant's Objection to Appellee's [Shinnicks'] Application for Attorneys Fees and Costs; Certificate of Service (Appellant Pro Per)
65.	29-Oct-2025	FILED: Appellant's Objection to Appellee Shinnicks' Statement of Costs; Certificate of Service (Appellant Pro Per)

Court of Appeals, Division One

Civil Appeal

1 CA-CV 24-0750

GIPSON v. SHINNICK, et al.

77 PROCEEDING ENTRIES

66.	4-Nov-2025	FILED: Appellee's [sic] Reply to Appellant's Objection to Appellee's [sic] Application for Attorneys' Fees; Certificate of Service (Appellees Shinnick)
67.	4-Nov-2025	FILED: Appellee's [sic] Reply to Appellant's Objection to Appellee's [sic] Statement of Costs; Certificate of Service (Appellees Shinnick)
68.	6-Nov-2025	FILED: Appellee Rental Renovators, Inc.'s Response to Motion for Reconsideration; Order for Response on Motion to Reconsider; Certificate of Service; Appellee Rental Renovators, Inc.'s Certificate of Compliance Re: Response to Motion for Reconsideration (Appellees Rental)
69.	8-Dec-2025	ORDERED: Appellant's Motion for Reconsideration (Appellant Pro Per) = GRANTED. FURTHER ORDERED: The opinion issued in this matter on 10/3/2025 is vacated and replaced by the opinion issued this date. Hon Samuel A Thumma - Author
70.	8-Dec-2025	OPINION (Affirmed in Part, Vacated in Part, Remanded) Hon Samuel A Thumma - Author; Hon Paul J McMurdie - Concur; Hon Kent E Cattani - Concur ORDERED: Awarding the Shinnicks \$13,225 in attorneys' fees and \$172.12 in taxable costs against Gipson. FURTHER ORDERED: Awarding Gipson \$3,540.20 in taxable costs against Rental Renovators.
71.	8-Dec-2025	FILED: Decision Distribution Notification
72.	10-Dec-2025	FILED: Notice of Withdrawal as Attorney of Record; Certificate of Service (Appellee Shinnick)
73.	12-Dec-2025	FILED: Amended Notice Of Withdrawal As Attorney Of Record; Certificate of Service (Appellees Shinnick)
74.	23-Dec-2025	FILED: Appellant's Motion for Reconsideration; Appellant's Certificate of Compliance; Certificate of Service (Appellant Pro Per)
75.	9-Jan-2026	ORDERED: Appellant's Motion for Reconsideration (Appellant Pro Per) = DENIED. Hon Samuel A Thumma - Author
76.	15-Jan-2026	FILED: Email Notice from ASC re: Petition for Review filed 01/14/2026; request for partial record
77.	15-Jan-2026	FILED: Letter forwarding partial record to Arizona Supreme Court